October 27, 2009

Via Facsimile

The Honorable John Conyers  
Chairman, House Judiciary Committee  
United States House of Representatives

The Honorable Lamar Smith  
Ranking Member, House Judiciary Committee  
United States House of Representatives

Re: Support for the Discount Pricing Consumer Protection Act of 2009 (H.R. 3190)

Representatives:

We, the undersigned Attorneys General, support “The Discount Consumer Protection Act of 2009,” H.R. 3190, which prohibits a vendor and a vendee from agreeing to the minimum price at which a product can be resold (“minimum resale price-fixing”). The bill would undo the United States Supreme Court’s decision in Leegin Creative Leather Products v. PSKS, Inc., 551 U.S. 877 (2007) that overruled the long-honored precedent of Dr. Miles Medical Co. v. John D. Park & Sons, Co., 220 U.S. 373 (1911), which established that minimum resale price-fixing is illegal per se under the Sherman Antitrust Act. This letter reiterates the opposition of Attorneys General to minimum resale price-fixing, as illustrated by the states’ amicus in Leegin and a letter last year in support of an earlier version of this legislation, S. 2261. We urge you to pass H.R. 3190.

H.R. 3190 states the very clear rule that “[a]ny agreement setting a price below which a product or service cannot be sold by a retailer, wholesaler, or distributor shall violate section 1 of the Sherman Act (15 U.S.C. § 1).” Passage of such a bright line law would preserve and foster both intrabrand and interbrand competition at every level of commerce, yielding a benefit for consumers from both cost efficiencies within the distribution chain as well as product qualities promoted by sellers and manufacturers of branded goods.

As one would expect, empirical studies show that agreements on minimum resale prices raise consumer prices, often significantly. And despite economic theories cited by the Supreme Court about how those agreements could enhance consumer welfare, we are not aware of any empirical study that shows enhanced consumer welfare in the form of services or other customer benefits. Sufficient experience with state “fair trade laws” during the middle of the last century evidenced that consumers paid significantly more for goods when manufacturers could maintain prices at the retail level. The added costs imposed by manufacturers, possibly
inuring to the benefit of some large retailers wishing to protect their own higher retail prices, reduces consumer welfare. With the *Leegin* decision now two years behind us, there remains no evidence that consumers are provided any tangible benefits, let alone benefits that outweigh the higher prices that result from minimum resale price fixing.

Congress has every right to reverse the *Leegin* decision. The Supreme Court rejected 96 years of antitrust jurisprudence that had served this nation’s consumers well. The Court rejected arguments that Congress had endorsed the per se rule in the Consumer Goods Pricing Act of 1975 and otherwise. This legislation provides an opportunity for Congress to overcome the Court’s view that Congress has been silent on and does not care about this issue. In any case, Congress, not the Court, is better positioned to evaluate the detrimental impact of resale price fixing on consumers and the underlying public policy of the nation’s antitrust laws.

Finally, we, as well as the proponents of minimum resale price fixing, know that the treatment of such practices under a “rule of reason” analysis will dramatically chill any challenge by individual retailers challenging resale price-fixing agreements. Our offices have all pursued such actions under the pre-*Leegin per se* rule and recovered more than $200 million in monetary relief for consumers. Since *Leegin*, lower courts have dismissed on the pleadings various challenges to minimum resale price fixing, which illustrates that our offices will need more resources and encounter significantly greater risks trying to achieve similar relief.

We encourage your passage of this legislation. Thank you for your consideration of this very important matter. Please contact us if you have any questions or comments.

Sincerely,

Richard Cordray  
Attorney General of Ohio

Chris Koster  
Attorney General of Missouri

Tom Miller  
Attorney General of Iowa

Gary King  
Attorney General of New Mexico

Terry Goddard  
Attorney General of Arizona

Dustin McDaniel  
Attorney General of Arkansas

Edmund G. Brown, Jr.  
Attorney General of California

Richard Blumenthal  
Attorney General of Connecticut
Joseph R. Biden, III  
Attorney General of Delaware

Bill McCollum  
Attorney General of Florida

Alicia G. Limtiaco  
Attorney General of Guam

Mark J. Bennett  
Attorney General of Hawaii

Lawrence Wasden  
Attorney General of Idaho

Lisa Madigan  
Attorney General of Illinois

Steve Six  
Attorney General of Kansas

James D. Caldwell  
Attorney General of Louisiana

Janet T. Mills  
Attorney General of Maine

Douglas Gansler  
Attorney General of Maryland

Martha Coakley  
Attorney General of Massachusetts

Lori Swanson  
Attorney General of Minnesota

Jim Hood  
Attorney General of Mississippi

Steve Bullock  
Attorney General of Montana
Catherine Cortez Masto  
Attorney General of Nevada

Anne Milgram  
Attorney General of New Jersey

Roy Cooper  
Attorney General of North Carolina

W.A. Drew Edmondson  
Attorney General of Oklahoma

Tom Corbett  
Attorney General of Pennsylvania

Patrick C. Lynch  
Attorney General of Rhode Island

Mark L. Shurtleff  
Attorney General of Utah

Michael A. Delaney  
Attorney General of New Hampshire

Andrew Cuomo  
Attorney General of New York

Wayne Stenehjem  
Attorney General of North Dakota

John R. Kroger  
Attorney General of Oregon

Antonio Sagardia  
Attorney General of Puerto Rico

Henry McMaster  
Attorney General of South Carolina

William H. Sorrell  
Attorney General of Vermont

In Support of H.R. 3190  
October 27, 2009  
Page 4
Vincent F. Frazer  
Attorney General of the U.S. Virgin Islands

William C. Mims  
Attorney General of Virginia

Rob McKenna  
Attorney General of Washington

Darrell V. McGraw, Jr.  
Attorney General of West Virginia

Bruce A. Salzburg  
Attorney General of Wyoming

Cc:
Members of House Judiciary Committee:  
Hon. Howard L. Berman  
Hon. Rick Boucher  
Hon. Jerrold Nadler  
Hon. Bobby Scott  
Hon. Mel Watt  
Hon. Zoe Lofgren  
Hon. Shelia Jackson Lee  
Hon. Maxine Waters  
Hon. Bill Delahunt  
Hon. Robert Wexler  
Hon. Steve Cohen  
Hon Hank Johnson  
Hon. Pedro Pierluisi  
Hon. Mike Quigley  
Hon. Judy Chu  
Hon. Luis V. Gutierrez  
Hon. Tammy Baldwin  
Hon. Charles A. Gonzalez  
Hon. Anthony Weiner  
Hon. Adam Schiff  
Hon. Linda Sanchez  
Hon. Debbie Wasserman Schultz  
Hon. Dan Maffei  
Hon. Jim Sensenbrenner  
Hon. Howard Coble  
Hon. Elton Gallegly  
Hon. Bob Goodlatte  
Hon. Dan Lungren  
Hon. Darrell Issa  
Hon. J. Randy Forbes  
Hon. Steve King  
Hon. Trent Franks  
Hon. Louie Gohmert  
Hon. Jim Jordan  
Hon. Ted Poe  
Hon. Jason Chaffetz  
Hon. Thomas J. Rooney  
Hon. Gregg Harper