May 23, 2019

Rep. Jerrold Nadler  
Chair  
House Committee on the Judiciary  
2138 Rayburn House Office Bldg.  
Washington, DC 20515

Rep. Doug Collins  
Ranking Member  
House Committee on the Judiciary  
2138 Rayburn House Office Bldg.  
Washington, DC 20515

Sen. Lindsey Graham  
Chair  
Senate Committee on the Judiciary  
224 Dirksen Senate Office Bldg.  
Washington, DC 20510

Sen. Dianne Feinstein  
Ranking Member  
Senate Committee on the Judiciary  
224 Dirksen Senate Office Bldg.  
Washington, DC 20510

Rep. Frank Pallone, Jr.  
Chair  
House Committee on Energy and Commerce  
2125 Rayburn House Office Bldg.  
Washington, DC 20515

Rep. Greg Walden  
Ranking Member  
House Committee on Energy and Commerce  
2322 Rayburn Bldg.  
Washington, DC 20515

Sen. Roger Wicker  
Chair  
Senate Committee on Commerce, Science, and Transportation  
512 Dirksen Senate Bldg.  
Washington, DC 20510

Sen. Maria Cantwell  
Ranking Member  
Senate Committee on Commerce, Science, and Transportation  
512 Dirksen Senate Bldg.  
Washington, DC 20510

RE: Amendment of Communications Decency Act (CDA)

Dear Congressional Leaders:

In 2013 and again in 2017, Attorneys General from virtually every state and territory wrote to inform Congress of a damaging misinterpretation and misapplication of Section 230 of the Communications Decency Act of 1996 (CDA) that rendered state and local authorities unable to enforce criminal laws against companies that actively profited from the promotion and facilitation of sex trafficking and crimes against children. To be sure, we are grateful for all the work you have done to protect the vulnerable among us. To bootstrap your efforts, we renew our recommendation for a modest but necessary amendment to the CDA. We must enable our state and local authorities to protect our citizens, including the most vulnerable among us, and to take appropriate action against criminal actors.
As noted in our earlier letters, some federal court opinions have interpreted the CDA so broadly that the perverse result has been to protect individuals and services that knowingly aid and profit from illegal activity online at the expense of the victims for whom the protection was intended. To that end, the impropriety of Section 230’s application to businesses that profited from the knowing promotion and facilitation of sex trafficking and crimes against children prompted Congress to enact the “Stop Enabling Sex Traffickers Act” and “Allow States and Victims to Fight Online Sex Trafficking Act” (known as FOSTA-SESTA). This bill, signed into law in 2018, provides that the CDA’s immunity does not apply to enforcement of federal or state sex trafficking laws.

While we welcome the ability to pursue some of the Internet’s most pernicious actors under FOSTA-SESTA, we sadly note that the abuse on these platforms does not stop at sex trafficking. Stories of online black market opioid sales, ID theft, deep fakes, election meddling, and foreign intrusion are now ubiquitous, and these growing phenomena will undoubtedly serve as the subjects of hearings throughout the 116th Congress. Current precedent interpreting the CDA, however, continues to preclude states and territories from enforcing their criminal laws against companies that, while not actually performing these unlawful activities, provide platforms that make these activities possible. Worse, the extensive safe harbor conferred to these platforms by courts promotes an online environment where these pursuits remain attractive and profitable to all involved, including the platforms that facilitate them.

Addressing criminal activity cannot be relegated to federal enforcement alone simply because the activity occurs online. The authorities in our states must be allowed to address these crimes themselves and fulfill our primary mandate to protect our citizens and enforce their rights. We therefore renew our recommendation that 47 U.S.C. § 230(e)(1) be amended to the following (added language in bold):

Nothing in this section shall be construed to impair the enforcement of section 223 or 231 of this title, chapter 71 (relating to obscenity) or 110 (relating to sexual exploitation of children) of title 18, or any other Federal, State, or Territorial criminal statute.

In its passage of FOSTA-SESTA, Congress understood that the immense challenges presented by sex trafficking on the Internet must be shared by Federal and State authorities. The increasing challenges presented by profiteers of the many other criminal enterprises online require the same level of investigation and prosecution that can only come from inclusion of State and Local resources. We ask that you adopt this simple addition to the CDA to remove the law’s restrictions on enforcement and enable us to better protect citizens nationwide.

Respectfully,

Jim Hood
Mississippi Attorney General

Ken Paxton
Texas Attorney General
Maura Healey
Massachusetts Attorney General

Keith Ellison
Minnesota Attorney General

Tim Fox
Montana Attorney General

Aaron D. Ford
Nevada Attorney General

Gurbir S. Grewal
New Jersey Attorney General

Letitia James
New York Attorney General

Wayne Stenehjem
North Dakota Attorney General

Mike Hunter
Oklahoma Attorney General

Wanda Vázquez Garced
Puerto Rico Attorney General

Dana Nessel
Michigan Attorney General

Eric S. Schmitt
Missouri Attorney General

Douglas Peterson
Nebraska Attorney General

Gordon MacDonald
New Hampshire Attorney General

Hector Balderas
New Mexico Attorney General

Josh Stein
North Carolina Attorney General

Dave Yost
Ohio Attorney General

Josh Shapiro
Pennsylvania Attorney General

Peter F. Neronha
Rhode Island Attorney General
Alan Wilson  
South Carolina Attorney General

Herbert H. Slatery III  
Tennessee Attorney General

T.J. Donovan  
Vermont Attorney General

Robert W. Ferguson  
Washington Attorney General

Joshua L. Kaul  
Wisconsin Attorney General

Jason R. Ravnsborg  
South Dakota Attorney General

Sean Reyes  
Utah Attorney General

Mark R. Herring  
Virginia Attorney General

Patrick Morrisey  
West Virginia Attorney General

CC  House Committee on the Judiciary Members  
Senate Committee on the Judiciary Members  
House Committee on Energy and Commerce Members  
Senate Committee on Commerce, Science, and Transportation Members