DANIEL E. LUNGREN, Attorney General 1 of the State of California RODERICK E. WALSTON 2 Chief Assistant Attorney General FILED CLERK, U.S. DISTRICT COURT 3 RICHARD N. LIGHT Deputy Attorney General BARBARA MOTZ, 4 Acting Assistant Attorney Generalerk, U.S. D State Bar No. 66933 5 CENTRAL DISTRICT OF CALIFORNIA BY DEPUTY 300 South Spring St. MAR I Los Angeles, CA 90013 6 Telephone: (213) 897-2691 CENTRAL DISTRICT CE CALL 7 Attorneys for State of Californiay 8 IN THE UNITED STATES DISTRICT COURT 9 FOR THE CENTRAL DISTRICT OF CALIFORNIA 10 11 12 STATE OF CALIFORNIA, Case No. CV-97-9356-IH Plaintiff. 13 (VAPx)14 **CONSENT DECREE** SHELL OIL COMPANY, a Delaware 15 corporation, and TEXACO, INC., a 16 Delaware corporation, 17 Defendants. 18 19

Plaintiff, the State of California, filed its Complaint herein and defendants, Shell Oil Company and Texaco, Inc., were duly served with copies of the Summons and Complaint. Defendants, by and through their attorneys, have consented to the entry of this Consent Decree without trial or adjudication of any issue of fact or law herein and have waived notice of presentation of this Consent Decree. This Consent Decree does not constitute any evidence against or an admission by any party with respect to any issue of law or fact herein.

WHEREAS, defendants have agreed to be bound by the provisions of this Consent

Decree; 27

28

20

21

22

23

24

25

WHEREAS, prompt and certain divestiture of certain assets is an essential element of this Consent Decree and the parties intend that defendants divest these assets as viable lines of business to ensure the assets will remain competitive, viable and on-going;

WHEREAS, the continued availability of crude oil from the San Joaquin Valley through a heated pipeline to the independent asphalt manufacturer in the San Francisco area is another essential element of this Consent Decree, and the parties intend that defendants continue to supply crude oil from the San Joaquin Valley on the Texaco heated pipeline to the independent asphalt manufacturer in the San Francisco area; and

WHEREAS, defendants have represented to plaintiff that they can comply with the obligations set forth in this Consent Decree and full relief as provided in this Consent Decree can be accomplished;

NOW, THEREFORE, before the taking of any testimony, and without trial or adjudication of any issue of fact or law herein, and upon consent of the parties hereto, IT IS HEREBY ORDERED, ADJUDGED, AND DECREED as follows:

I.

JURISDICTION

This Court has jurisdiction over the subject matter of this action and over each of the parties hereto. The Complaint states a claim upon which relief may be granted against the defendants under Section 7 of the Clayton Act, as amended (15 U.S.C.§ 18), and Sections 1 and 2, of the Sherman Act, (15 U.S.C.§§ 1 and 2), and California Business and Professions Code section 17200 et seq. The Attorney General for the State of California, Daniel E. Lungren, has authority to bring this action pursuant to Section 16 of the Clayton Act (15 U.S.C.§ 26) and California Business and Professions Code sections 17204 and 17206.

II.

DEFINITIONS

As used in this Final Judgment:

A. "Commission" means the Federal Trade Commission.

5

8

9 10

11 12

13

14 15

16

17

18 19

20

21

22 23

24

25

26 27

- "Defendants" means Shell and Texaco, individually and jointly, and the Joint B. Venture.
- C. "Divestiture Period" means six months from the date the Commission either finally approves or rejects the Agreement Containing Consent Order, File 971-0026, In the Matter of Shell Oil Company and Texaco Inc., or by November 15, 1998, whichever is earlier. Provided however, if the Commission has approved the Agreement and (1) the defendants have fully complied with this Consent Decree; (2) defendants within four (4) months after issuance of the Commission's final Order have submitted a complete application in support of the divestiture of the San Diego Divestiture Assets, (including the buyer, manner of divestiture and all other matters subject to the plaintiff's approval); and (3) the plaintiff has approved the divestiture and has not withdrawn its acceptance; but (4) defendants have certified to the plaintiff within ten (10) days after its approval that the Commission, notwithstanding timely and complete application by defendants to the Commission, has failed to approve the divestiture under the Commission's Order, then the time in which the divestiture is required to be completed under this Consent Decree shall be extended for sixty (60) days. During such sixty (60) day period, defendants shall exercise utmost good faith and best efforts to resolve the concerns of the Commission.
- "Huntway" means Huntway Refining Company, with offices located at 1651 D. Alameda Street, Wilmington, California 90744, and any of its successors or assigns that continue the operation of Huntway's asphalt refinery at Benecia, California.
- E. "Huntway Supply Agreement" means the agreement or agreements between Huntway and Texaco pursuant to which Texaco will supply heavy crude oil to Huntway from the San Joaquin Valley, dated November 25, 1997, and filed separately under seal as Exhibit A to the Consent Decree. Subject to the provisions of Paragraph VI.C. of this Consent Decree, Huntway and defendants may from, time to time, amend the Huntway Supply Agreement.
- "Joint Venture" means the joint venture between Shell and Texaco known as "Westco" (publicly announced on March 18, 1997 and described in a Memorandum of

Understanding of the same date) and any other combination of defendants' U.S. refining and marketing affecting the State of California, and all of their directors, officers, employees, agents and representatives, predecessors, successors, and assigns; subsidiaries, divisions, groups and affiliates, and the respective directors, officers, employees, agents, and representatives, successors, and assigns of each.

- G. "Long Term Lease" means a lease the terms of which allow defendants to divest to the acquirer of Retail Assets a right to occupy the Retail Site for ten years or longer from the date of divestiture, and where such divestiture is not subject to a landlord approval or, if subject to such approval, defendants have obtained the necessary approval prior to the divestiture. A "Long Term Lease" does not include a leasehold interest in which any defendant is a lessor.
- H. "Retail Assets" means, for each Retail Site, all assets, tangible or intangible, that are used at that Retail Site, including but not limited to all related permits and contracts, and all assets, relating to all ancillary businesses (such as automobile mechanical service, convenience store, restaurant or car wash) located at each Retail Site. Defendants shall make good faith diligent efforts to obtain all third-party approvals necessary to convey all licenses, permits, consents, and ancillary businesses with each Retail Site. "Retail Assets" do not include defendants' proprietary trademarks, trade names, logos, trade dress, identification signs, additized product inventory, petroleum franchise agreements, petroleum product supply agreements, credit card agreements, satellite-based or centralized credit card processing equipment not incorporated in gasoline dispensers, or system-wide software and databases. Upon divestiture, defendants shall cancel all dealer leases, dealer loans, building incentive agreements, and related dealer agreements between defendants and their lessee dealers applicable to divested Retail Sites.
- I. "Retail Site" means a business establishment from which gasoline is sold to the general public, commonly known as a gasoline station or service station.
- J. "San Diego Divestiture Assets" means a package of San Diego Retail Assets, to be identified by defendants and approved by plaintiff, that (1) in the aggregate had retail

gasoline sales of at least 43,200,000 gallons during calendar year 1996; (2) contains no individual Retail Site that averaged less than 85,000 gallons of gasoline sales per month during 1996; (3) complies with applicable federal and state 1998 requirements for underground storage tanks; and (4) for each Retail Site, defendants can convey fee ownership or a Long Term Lease.

- K. "San Diego Retail Assets" means all Retail Assets in San Diego County, California, that are owned by Defendants or leased by Defendants from another person.
 - L. "San Diego" means the County of San Diego.
- M. "Shell" means Shell Oil Company, its directors, officers, employees, agents and representatives, predecessors, successors, and assigns, and its joint ventures including the Joint Venture, and its subsidiaries, divisions, groups and affiliates controlled by Shell, and the respective directors, officers, employees, agents, and representatives, successors, and assigns of each.
- N. "Texaco" means Texaco, Inc., its directors, officers, employees, agents and representatives, predecessors, successors, and assigns, its joint ventures including the Joint Venture, and its subsidiaries, divisions, groups and affiliates controlled by Texaco, and the respective directors, officers, employees, agents, and representatives, successors, and assigns of each.

III.

APPLICABILITY

- A. The provisions of this Consent Decree apply to the defendants, their successors and assigns, their subsidiaries, affiliates, directors, officers, managers, agents, and employees, and all other persons in active concert or participation with any of them who shall have received actual notice of this Consent Decree by personal service or otherwise.
- B. Nothing herein shall suggest that any portion of this Consent Decree is or has been created for the benefit of any third party and nothing herein shall be construed to provide any rights to third parties.

gasoline sales of at least 43,200,000 gallons during calendar year 1996; (2) contains no individual Retail Site that averaged less than 85,000 gallons of gasoline sales per month during 1996; (3) complies with applicable federal and state 1998 requirements for underground storage tanks; and (4) for each Retail Site, defendants can convey fee ownership or a Long Term Lease.

- K. "San Diego Retail Assets" means all Retail Assets in San Diego County,

 California, that are owned by Respondents or leased by Respondents from another person.
 - L. "San Diego" means the County of San Diego.
- M. "Shell" means Shell Oil Company, its directors, officers, employees, agents and representatives, predecessors, successors, and assigns, and its joint ventures including the Joint Venture, and its subsidiaries, divisions, groups and affiliates controlled by Shell, and the respective directors, officers, employees, agents, and representatives, successors, and assigns of each.
- N. "Texaco" means Texaco, Inc., its directors, officers, employees, agents and representatives, predecessors, successors, and assigns, its joint ventures including the Joint Venture, and its subsidiaries, divisions, groups and affiliates controlled by Texaco, and the respective directors, officers, employees, agents, and representatives, successors, and assigns of each.

III.

APPLICABILITY

- A. The provisions of this Consent Decree apply to the defendants, their successors and assigns, their subsidiaries, affiliates, directors, officers, managers, agents, and employees, and all other persons in active concert or participation with any of them who shall have received actual notice of this Consent Decree by personal service or otherwise.
- B. Nothing herein shall suggest that any portion of this Consent Decree is or has been created for the benefit of any third party and nothing herein shall be construed to provide any rights to third parties.

DIVESTITURE OF ASSETS

- A. Defendants are hereby ordered and directed, within the Divestiture Period, to divest to a single acquirer, absolutely, in good faith, and at no minimum price, the San Diego Divestiture Assets.
- B. Defendants shall divest the San Diego Divestiture Assets only to a single acquirer that receives the prior approval of the plaintiff, only in a manner that receives the prior approval of plaintiff, and only after plaintiff has approved the specific Retail Assets to be divested.
- C. The purpose of the divestiture is to ensure the continued use of the San Diego Divestiture Assets in the same business in which the San Diego Divestiture Assets were engaged prior to the formation of the proposed Joint Venture, and to remedy the lessening of competition and the proposed act(s) or practice(s) of unfair competition in the wholesale and retail sales of gasoline in San Diego resulting from the proposed Joint Venture as alleged in the plaintiff's Complaint.
- D. Defendants shall establish to the satisfaction of the plaintiff: (1) that the acquirer has the managerial, operational, and financial capability to compete effectively as a viable, ongoing retailer of gasoline in San Diego; (2) that the purchase is for the purpose of competing effectively in the retailing of gasoline in San Diego; and (3) that the acquisition of the divested assets will not adversely affect competition in the retailing of gasoline in San Diego.
- E. Plaintiff's decision to approve or disapprove the acquirer shall be based on the criteria set forth in Paragraph IV.D.
- F. Pending the divestiture of the San Diego Divestiture Assets, defendants shall take such actions as are necessary to maintain the viability, marketability, and competitiveness of the San Diego Retail Assets and to prevent the destruction, removal, wasting, deterioration, or impairment of any of the San Diego Retail Assets, except for ordinary wear and tear. Defendants shall take no action that would jeopardize the divestiture

of the San Diego Retail Assets. Defendants shall continue at their scheduled pace all capital projects involving the San Diego Retail Assets that were ongoing, planned or approved as of or after October 1, 1997 and otherwise maintain the San Diego Retail Assets until the date of divestiture to the same standards and on the same schedule as defendants have been maintaining the San Diego Retail Assets. Defendants shall not remove or degrade the brand identification at the San Diego Retail Assets to be divested, until the San Diego Divestiture Assets are divested.

- G. In accomplishing the divestiture ordered by this Consent Decree, the defendants shall make known, by usual and customary means, the availability of the San Diego Divestiture Assets. The defendants shall provide a copy of the Consent Decree to any person making inquiry regarding a possible purchase. The defendants shall also offer to furnish to any bona fide prospective purchaser, subject to customary confidentiality assurances, all customary and reasonably necessary information regarding the San Diego Divestiture Assets, except such information subject to attorney-client privilege or attorney work product immunity or other legally recognized privilege. As set forth in Paragraph IV.H. herein, the defendants shall make such information available to the plaintiff unless such information has already been provided to plaintiff. Defendants shall permit bona fide prospective purchasers of the San Diego Divestiture Assets to have access to personnel and to make such inspection of physical facilities and any and all financial, operational, or other documents and information as may be relevant to the divestiture required by this Consent Decree, and is of a kind that is customarily provided in the sale of retail gasoline stations.
- H. Defendants shall take all reasonable steps to accomplish quickly the divestitures contemplated by this Consent Decree.
- I. Beginning sixty (60) days from the date when this Consent Decree becomes final, and every sixty (60) days thereafter until the divestiture has been completed or a trustee is appointed, defendants shall deliver to plaintiff a written report as to the fact and manner of compliance with Paragraph IV of the Consent Decree. Each such report shall include, for each person who during the preceding sixty (60) days made an offer, expressed

an interest or desire to acquire, entered into negotiations to acquire, or made an inquiry about acquiring any ownership interest in all or any portion of the divestiture assets, the name, address, and telephone number of that person and a detailed description of each contact with that person during that period, as well as written communications to and from each person, and all internal memoranda and all reports and recommendations concerning the divestiture, except such information subject to attorney-client privilege or attorney work product immunity or other legally recognized privilege. Defendants shall maintain full records of all efforts made to divest all or any portion of the San Diego Divestiture Assets.

- J. Defendants shall indemnify the State for any and all liability, losses, claims, and damage the State may incur by reason of the defendants' failure to comply with their obligations, if any, under the Petroleum Marketing Practices Act, 28 U.S.C. section 2801 et seq., or Chapter 7.5 of the California Business and Professional Code, in connection with the sale of the San Diego Divestiture Assets. Provided, however, the indemnity shall not include costs and attorneys' fees associated with any legal action under such laws.
- K. For a period of twelve (12) months from the date the San Diego Divestiture

 Assets are transferred to the acquirer, defendants shall not enter into any franchise agreement with the acquirer to supply gasoline or other refined petroleum products to those divested Retail Sites.
- L. Following divestiture, for a period of ten years, defendants, either individually or jointly, shall not, without providing thirty (30) days advanced written notice to the plaintiff, acquire directly or indirectly, through subsidiaries, partnerships or otherwise, in any twelve month period calendar year: (a) more than five Retail Sites selling gasoline to consumers in San Diego; or (b) the stock, share capital, equity or other controlling interest in any concern, corporate or non-corporate, that owns more than five Retail Sites selling gasoline to consumers in San Diego. If, within the thirty (30) days after receiving such notice plaintiff makes a written request for additional information or documentation, defendants shall not consummate the transaction until twenty (20) days after submitting such additional information or documentation. Provided, however, in the case of an acquisition of

the stock, share capital, equity or other controlling interest in any concern that owns more than five Retail Sites selling gasoline to consumers in San Diego, defendants may consummate the transaction without providing additional information and documents or waiting twenty (20) additional days, if defendants make a binding commitment to divest, on terms acceptable to plaintiff, sufficient Retail Sites in San Diego so that defendants acquire no more than five Retail Sites net through the acquisition.

V.

20

22

24

25 26

27

28

APPOINTMENT OF TRUSTEE

- In the event that defendants have not divested the San Diego Divestiture Assets Α. within the Divestiture Period and that time has not been extended by plaintiff in writing, plaintiff, subject to Paragraph V.B. of this Consent Decree, shall have the right to apply to the Court to appoint as trustee David Prend or, if David Prend is unable to serve as trustee, another person or persons agreed upon by Plaintiff and the Commission, if the Commission has the right to appoint a trustee pursuant to the Commission Consent Order File 971-0026. Plaintiff shall provide to the defendants and to the Commission notice of any application to the Court for the appointment of a trustee.
- If David Prend is unable to serve as trustee, the selection of a candidate to be В. trustee shall be a person with experience and expertise in acquisitions and divestitures and shall be subject to the consent of defendants, which consent shall not be unreasonably withheld. If defendants have not opposed, in writing, including the reasons for opposing, the appointment of any proposed trustee, within ten (10) days after notice by the plaintiff to defendants of the identity of any proposed trustee, defendants shall be deemed to have consented to the selection of the proposed trustee.
- C. The trustee may select Retail Assets from among all of defendants' San Diego Retail Assets that defendants own in fee or can divest a Long Term Lease for divestiture in accordance with the requirements of Paragraph IV and the definition of San Diego Divestiture Assets.

- D. Within ten (10) days after appointment of the trustee, defendants shall execute a trustee agreement that has been approved by plaintiff, which approval shall not be unreasonably withheld, that transfers to the trustee all rights and powers necessary to permit the trustee to effect the divestitures required by this Consent Decree.
- E. The trustee shall have twelve (12) months from the date the trust agreement is approved to accomplish the divestiture, which shall be subject to the prior approval of plaintiff. The Court, upon Plaintiff's application, may extend the time period for divestiture, if, at the end of the twelve-month period, the trustee has submitted a plan of divestiture or believes the divestiture can be accomplished within a reasonable period of time. Plaintiff may apply to the Court to extend this period only two (2) times.
- F. After the appointment of a trustee becomes effective, only the trustee shall have the right to divest the San Diego Divestiture Assets. Unless the plaintiff otherwise consents in writing, the divestiture shall be made to an acquirer for whom it is demonstrated to the sole satisfaction of the plaintiff: (1) that the acquirer has the managerial, operational and financial capability to compete effectively as a viable, ongoing retailer of gasoline in San Diego; (2) that the purchase is for the purpose of competing effectively in the retailing of gasoline in San Diego; and (3) that the acquisition of the divested assets will not adversely affect competition in the retailing of gasoline in San Diego.
- G. The trustee shall have the power and authority to hire, at the cost and expense of defendants, any investment bankers, attorneys, or other agents or assistants reasonably necessary in the judgment of the trustee to carry out the trustee's duties and responsibilities. Subject to the obligations set forth in Paragraph V.J. herein and other fiduciary obligations, the trustee shall have the power and authority to accomplish the divestiture at the earliest possible time to an acquirer acceptable to the plaintiff and shall have such other powers as this Court shall deem appropriate. Defendants shall not object to a sale by the trustee on any grounds other than (1) the trustee's malfeasance, (2) gross negligence, (3) breach of fiduciary duty, or (4) that the sale is contrary to the express terms of this Consent Decree. Any such

3

4 5

6 7

8

9 10

11

12

13 14

15

16

17

18

19 20

21

22

23

24

25 26

27

28

objections by defendants must be conveyed in writing to the plaintiff and the trustee within ten (10) days after the trustee has provided the notice required under Paragraph VII.

- The trustee shall serve at the cost and expense of defendants on reasonable and H. customary terms and conditions, and shall account for all monies derived from the sale of the assets sold by the trustee and all costs and expenses so incurred. The compensation of such trustee, and that of any professionals and agents retained by the trustee, shall be reasonable in light of the value of the divestiture assets and based on a fee arrangement providing the trustee with an incentive tied to the price and terms of the divestiture. Upon the completion of his or her obligations under the trust agreement, the trustee shall prepare an accounting. reflecting all costs, expenses, sales and fees paid to professionals and agents retained by the trustee. If the defendants do not object to the accounting within 10 days, the trustee shall pay all remaining monies to defendants and the trust shall then be terminated. If the defendants object to the trustee's accounting, the defendants shall file the trustee's accounting and their objections with the Court, and the trustee shall make payment of the remaining monies, if any, in accordance with the Court's orders.
- Defendants shall use their best efforts to assist the trustee in accomplishing the I. required divestiture. The trustee, and any consultants, accountants, attorneys, and other persons retained by the trustee, shall have, to the extent relevant to the San Diego Retail Assets, full and complete access to the personnel, books, records, and facilities of defendants, and defendants shall develop such financial or other information relevant to such assets as the trustee may reasonably request, subject to reasonable protection for privileged communications, trade secrets, or other confidential research, development, or commercial information. Defendants shall take no action to interfere with or to impede the trustee's accomplishment of the divestiture.
- J. The trustee shall use his or her best efforts to negotiate the most favorable price and terms for the assets to be divested, subject to defendants' absolute and unconditional obligation to make the divestiture required by this Consent Decree at no minimum price. The divestiture shall be made in the manner and to the purchaser as set out

in Paragraph IV of this Consent Decree; provided, however, if the trustee receives bona fide offers from more than one purchaser, and if the plaintiff approves more than one such purchaser, the trustee shall divest to the purchaser selected by defendants from among those approved by the plaintiff.

- K. Defendants shall indemnify the trustee and hold the trustee harmless against any losses, claims, damages, liabilities, or expenses arising out of, or in connection with, the performance of the trustee's duties, including all reasonable fees of counsel and other expenses incurred in connection with the preparation for, or defense of any claim, whether or not resulting in any liability, except to the extent that such liabilities, losses, damages, claims, or expenses result from misfeasance, gross negligence, willful or wanton acts, breach of fiduciary duty, or bad faith by the trustee.
- L. After its appointment, the trustee shall file reports every sixty (60) days with the parties and the Court setting forth the trustee's efforts to accomplish the divestiture ordered under this Consent Decree.
- M. The appointment of a trustee, or failure to appoint a trustee, is not an exclusive remedy and shall not preclude the plaintiff from seeking civil penalties or any other relief available to it, for defendants' failure to comply with this Decree.

VI.

CRUDE PIPELINE ACCESS

- A. Defendants shall provide heavy crude oil to Huntway pursuant to the Huntway Supply Agreement for a period of ten years from the effective starting date of the Huntway Supply Agreement. The Huntway Supply Agreement shall be fully assignable to any successor of Huntway that continues to operate the asphalt refinery now operated by Huntway, and may be cancelled by Defendants only if Huntway's asphalt refinery ceases operations "permanently," as such "permanent" cessation is defined in the Huntway Supply Agreement.
- B. ___ The purpose of the requirements of this Paragraph is to ensure that Texaco's volumes and prices of undiluted heavy crude oil supplied to Huntway are unaffected by

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

23

24

25

26

27

28

changes in Texaco's incentives as a result of combining with Shell, so as to prevent (1) the raising of costs for undiluted heavy crude oil to Shell's asphalt competitor, and (2) the raising of prices for asphalt in northern California, as alleged in the plaintiff's Complaint.

C. For a period of ten (10) years from the date this Consent Decree becomes final, defendants shall not, without the prior approval of the plaintiff, directly or indirectly, reduce the volumes offered to Huntway, increase the price for crude oil supplied to Huntway, or terminate the Huntway Supply Agreement, except according to the terms of the Huntway Supply Agreement. Any amendment to the Huntway Supply Agreement relating to an increase in price, a decrease in volume, or termination shall not be effective until approved by the plaintiff, provided, however, that any such amendment shall be deemed approved unless the plaintiff notifies defendants, within ninety (90) days of the plaintiff receiving actual notice of the amendment, of the plaintiff's intention to consider the amendment further.

VII.

NOTIFICATION OF PROPOSED DIVESTITURE

Within two (2) business days following execution of a letter of intent or a definitive agreement for sale of the San Diego Divestiture Assets, defendants or the trustee, whichever is then responsible for effecting the divestiture required herein, shall notify the plaintiff of any proposed divestiture required by Paragraph IV or V of this Consent Decree. If the trustee is responsible, he or she shall likewise notify Defendants. The notice shall set forth the details of the proposed transaction and list the name, address, and telephone number of each person not previously identified who offered or expressed an interest in or desire to acquire any ownership interest in the divestiture assets, together with full details of the same. Within fifteen (15) days after receipt of the notice, the plaintiff may request additional information concerning the proposed divestiture, the proposed purchaser, and any other potential purchaser. Defendants or the trustee shall furnish the additional information within fifteen (15) days of the receipt of the request. Within thirty (30) days after receipt of the notice or within fifteen (15) days after receipt of the additional information, whichever is

later, the plaintiff shall notify in writing defendants and the trustee, if there is one, if it objects to the proposed divestiture. If the plaintiff fails to object within the period specified, or if the plaintiff notifies in writing defendants and the trustee, if there is one, that it does not object, then the divestiture may be consummated, subject only to defendants' limited right to object to the sale under Paragraph V.G. Upon objection by the plaintiff, or upon objection by defendants under Paragraph V.G., the proposed divestiture shall not be accomplished unless approved by the Court.

VIII.

COMPLIANCE INSPECTION

- A. Defendants shall provide Plaintiff with an annual verified report, detailing the manner in which they have complied and are complying with the provisions of this Consent Decree. Said annual report shall be due at the same time similar verified reports are filed with the Commission, or if such reports are not filed with the Commission, then on the anniversary of the signing of this Consent Decree.
- B. For the purpose of determining or securing compliance with this Consent Decree, and subject to any legally recognized privilege, from time to time:
- 1. Duly authorized representatives of the plaintiff, including consultants and other persons, shall, upon the written request of the plaintiff, and on reasonable notice to Defendants made to its principal offices, be permitted:
 - a. access during office hours to inspect and copy all books, ledgers, accounts, correspondence, memoranda, and other records and documents in the possession or under the control of defendants, which may have counsel present, relating to any matters contained in this Consent Decree; and
 - b. subject to the reasonable convenience of defendants and without restraint or interference from them, to interview directors, officers, employees, and agents of defendants, or of the joint venture which may have counsel present, regarding any such matters.

- 2. Upon the written request of the plaintiff, made to defendants at their principal offices, defendants shall submit written reports, under oath if requested, with respect to any of the matters contained in this Consent Decree as may be requested.
- 3. No information nor any documents obtained by the means provided in this Paragraph VIII shall be divulged by any representative of the plaintiff to any person other than a duly authorized representative of the California Attorney General, except in the course of legal proceedings to which the plaintiff is a party, or for the purpose of securing compliance with this Consent Decree, or as otherwise required by law.
- 4. If, at the time information or documents are furnished by defendants to the Plaintiff, Defendants represent and identify in writing the material in any such information or documents for which a claim of protection may be asserted under Rule 26(c)(7) of the Federal Rules of Civil Procedure, and defendants mark each pertinent page of such material, "Confidential" or "Subject to claim of protection under Rule 26(c)(7) of the Federal Rules of Civil Procedure," then the plaintiff shall give ten (10) days' notice to the marking defendant prior to divulging such material in any legal proceeding, except in proceedings to enforce compliance with this Consent Decree, in which case the plaintiff shall give five (5) days' notice to the marking defendant prior to divulging such material.

IX.

NOTICES

Any notices required by this Consent Decree shall be delivered to the parties at the following addresses:

- A. For Shell:
 Charles W. Corddry
 Shell Oil Company, 48th Flr.
 P. O. Box 2463
 One Shell Plaza
 Houston, Texas 77002-2463
- B. For Texaco
 Robert E. Fuller
 Texaco, Inc.
 10 Universal City Plaza
 Universal City, California 91608

| , | |
|------------|---|
| 1 | C. For the State: |
| 2 | BARBARA M. MOTZ |
| 3 | Acting Assistant Attorney General 300 South Spring St. Los Angeles, CA 90013 |
| 4 | Los Aligeles, CA 90013 |
| 5 | X. |
| 6 | RETENTION OF JURISDICTION |
| 7 | Jurisdiction is retained by this Court for the purpose of enabling any of the parties to |
| 8 | this Consent Decree to apply to this Court at any time for such further orders and directions |
| 9 | as may be necessary or appropriate for the construction, implementation, or modification of |
| 10 | any of the provisions of this Consent Decree, for the enforcement of compliance herewith, |
| 11 | and for the punishment of any violations hereof. |
| 12 | XI. |
| 13 | COMMISSION ORDER |
| 14 | Any action or inaction by Defendants that is required by any order of the Commission |
| 15 | relating to File 971-0026, In the Matter of Shell Oil Company and Texaco, Inc., or the order |
| 16 | of any court shall not violate this Consent Decree. |
| 17 | XII. |
| 18 | OTHER RELIEF |
| 19 | A. If defendants fail to comply with the terms of this Consent Decree, the Court |
| 2 0 | shall enter an award of civil penalties, pursuant to Calif. Bus. & Prof. Code section 17207, |
| 21 | for violations of this Consent Decree. Provided however, it shall not be deemed |
| 22 | noncompliance pursuant to this Paragraph XII.A. if the Defendants' noncompliance is the |
| 23 | result of: |
| 24 | 1. the failure of the purchaser to take possession of the San Diego |
| 25 | Divestiture Assets pursuant to an executed agreement; |
| 26 | 2. the failure to divest as the result of inconsistent actions by plaintiff and |

28

the Commission on an application for divestiture; or

| 1 | any divestiture of the San Diego Divestiture Assets by the defendants |
|----------|---|
| 2 | that has been approved by the Commission pursuant to any Decree of |
| 3 | the Commission relating to File 971-0026, In the Matter of Shell Oil |
| 4 | Company and Texaco, Inc. |
| 5 | B. Plaintiff is awarded its attorneys' fees and costs in the amount of \$106,250.00. |
| 6 | Defendants shall pay this sum to plaintiff within thirty (30) days of entry of this Consent |
| 7 | Decree. |
| 8 | XIII. |
| 9 | TERMINATION OF PROVISIONS |
| 10 | This Consent Decree will expire on the tenth anniversary of the date of its entry. |
| 11 | XIV. |
| 12 | PUBLIC INTEREST |
| 13 | Entry of this Consent Decree is in the public interest. |
| 14 15 | DATED this day of December, 1997. |
| 16 | IRVING HILL |
| 17 | UNITED STATES DISTRICT JUDGE |
| 18 | Presented by: |
| 19 | State of California, by: |
| 20 | DANIEL E. LUNGREN, Attorney General of the State of California |
| 21 | RODERICK E. WALSTON, Chief Assistant Attorney General |
| 22 | |
| 23 | Barbara M. Mes |
| 24 25 | BARBARA M. MOTZ, Acting Assistant Attorney General Attorneys for Plaintiff |
| 25 | TELLOTING JO TO A AMERICAN |
| 20 | |
| | |

TEXACO, INC.

Robert E. Fuller
Senior Attorney stare dare No. (7/776
TEXACO, INC.
10 Universal City Plaza
University City, CA 91608
(818) 505-3916

Attorney for Defendant Texaco, Inc.

SHELL OIL COMPANY by:

Charles W. Corddry III
Senior Attorney
SHELL OIL COMPANY
One Shell Plaza
910 Louisiana
Houston, TX 77002

Attorney for Defendant Shell Oil Company